The authors are prominent members of what could be called the education-oriented, knowledge-for-knowledge's-sake side of archaeology that dominated the field for so long, but that is now in the minority (a part of the discipline with which I have a strong attachment to and sympathy with). American archaeology, both practical and theoretical, is now dominated by cultural resource management (CRM) which receives only brief mention in the epilogue of the book. CRM has been around for over half a century, as the authors point out in earlier chapters. Indeed, the senior author was involved in WPA archaeology during the depression. The authors chose, however, to ignore CRM in the present (their bibliography includes only two CRM reports, one written 10 years ago and one written 20 years ago), in part, no doubt because of their own unfamiliarity with the topic and literature but also because they may never have completed this edition if they had taken CRM as a serious subject for historical research! They refer to the "gray literature" problem in archaeology (p. 315), an issue that makes writing a history of archaeological in the last 15 years a daunting and nearly impossible task. The problem has improved somewhat because many private firms have started publication series, making their CRM reports available to a wider audience than merely government bureaucrats. Unfortunately, because of declining library budgets it is unlikely that complete sets of any of these series get to libraries, so that the task of the CRM historian is only slightly easier than it was ten years ago.

Because archaeologists in CRM are under no pressure to get tenure or to fill their vitae, they are much less likely to publish articles in major journals, with the result that information of CRM work is more localized, even though it often is at the cutting edge of method and theory in the discipline. Thus, the luxury of writing a history of recent American archaeology from what is available in a major library is simply not possible and whoever seriously takes on the task will have to wear out many pairs of shoes and accumulate numerous frequent flyer miles to get it done adequately!

The bibliography of the book is extensive and quite useful, although it needs more careful editing as there are a number of errors or omissions (e.g., Baldwin 1872 is not in the references nor was it in the last edition). Peculiarly, this is the only book that I have ever encountered where the text begins on p. 0.

If you have the second edition of this volume, hold onto it. If you don't have that volume and need a single volume summary of the major trends in American archaeology, this is it, but don't expect to obtain much enlightenment about what was happening in the field in the 1980s and early 1990s.

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.5334/bha.05207


Reviewed by

David L. Browman
Department of Anthropology
Washington University - Saint Louis

Ponce proposes to develop an intellectual history of Posnansky, whom many view as the father of Bolivian archaeology, which he hopes will contribute to the establishment of context for the development of local prehistory. However, for the most part, the volume serves more as a foil for Ponce to refer to his own work and publications, as they update, contradict, and improve on the earlier archaeological reconstructions of Posnansky.

Arthur Posnansky (1873-1946) was an important contributor to Bolivian culture history, being not only a pioneer in Bolivian archaeology, but also in Bolivian cinematography, in the development of the national park system, and in the introduction of the first automobile into Bolivia. He was trained as a naval engineer in his native Vienna, a skill which he quickly parlayed into a fortune in Bolivia in the rubber boom, in terms of transporting the latex by river transport. With the loss of Arco to Brazil in 1903, he shifted his focus to other fields. He brought the first gasoline-powered motor boat to Lake Titicaca that year, and while visiting the excavations of the French Crequi-Montfort and Senechal de La Grange Mission, under the direction of George Courty, during trips to the lake, he became very intrigued with the site of Tiwanaku and its place in Bolivian prehistory. Posnansky shortly thereafter began his extensive collection of material artifacts from Tiwanaku, constructing the "Palacio Tihuanacu" in 1917-1918 to house the stela, ceramics and other materials which he collected. This structure and its collections were subsequently sold to the state, becoming the current the Museo Nacional de Arqueologia.

Posnansky's maritime interests led him to understand now isolated strand lines as the remnants of once higher levels of Lake Titicaca. This led him to his theory of catastrophe at Tiwanaku, a theme he kept publishing on through his life, wherein he proposed a seismic cataclysm resulting in the flooding and abandonment of Tiwanaku. Ponce trashes the idea as inappropriate influence of Cuvier style biological catastrophism, but we should remember that Michael Moseley and Alan Kolata, fresh from their work at Chan Chan in the early 1980s, where seismic factors were extremely critical, also delivered papers invoking seismic disasters for Tiwanaku, although they now invoke other mechanisms for the collapse of this polity.
Posnansky thought that he could identify three different sets of ethnic influences at Tiwanaku: Aymara, Quechua, and Arawak (Uru). He used Tiwanaku as part of the backdrop for the first ethnographic film in Bolivia on the Uru in 1926, title "La Gloria de la Raza". Ponce argues that Posnansky's somatic-racial studies were due to influence from racial theories of a fellow Austrian, Adolph Hitler, but no evidence is provided to back up this speculation.

The culmination of Posnansky's work is his four volume, quarto-size, opus, Tihuanacu, La Cuna del Hombre Americano/The Cradle of American Man, which was published with half the page in Spanish and the facing half in English translation. (Volumes. 1 & 27 1945; Volumes 3 & 4, 1957). Volume 1 is an elaboration of the evidence he found for geological change in the Titicaca basin and the basis for his catastrophism theory; Volume 2 illustrates the iconography of the Gateway of the Sun and the other important stone statuary of Tiwanaku; volume 3 illustrates ceramics, and Volume 4 includes his take on somatology and the physical anthropology of the indigenous inhabitants. Posnansky was a naval engineer with no archaeological training, but to his credit he essentially collected, conserved, and preserved the artifacts, and did not conduct excavations. His volumes are the only known illustrations of many pieces since lost or destroyed. When he first proposed his seismic cataclysm ideas in 1910, little was known about the site. In later years first Max Uhle, and then Jose Imbelloni, Dick Edgar Ibarra Grasso, and Juan Comas, attacked some of Posnansky’s theories. Thus in the 1930s and 1940s, when Posnansky was in his 60s and 70s, most of his papers at meetings were addressed to defending his increasingly difficult to support theories about tectonic catastrophism as the raison d'être of Tiwanaku collapse.

The volume includes some observations by Ponce on Wendell Bennett’s work at Tiwanaku in 1932 and of Eduardo Casanova’s excavation later that year, as well as of some of the contribution of another important pioneer, Gregorio Cordero Miranda (19221979). We also learn that Posnansky conducted some additional site surveys, identifying the examples of the Pa-ajunu or Pajano style (two-faced) stela in Huata and Mocachi in 1936, and the large Tiwanaku-style palace or kalasasaya at Chukuperkha, Canton Ojje, on the Copacabana peninsula in 1940; thus contrary to some authorities, he did not perceive Tiwanaku as unique, nor without regional roots.

Although the volume is approached more from the perspective of what Ponce considers to be the “correct” interpretations of the construction and functioning of the Tiwanaku site, it is the best single modern source on Posnansky’s contributions. For more on Posnansky’s other work, the reader is directed to the two sources below.

Comité Conmemorativo de Nacimiento de Arturo Posnansky

Sociedad Geografica de La Paz